

**Livingston County Board of Review
Minutes – November 10, 2020**

The Board of Review convened at 9:30am. Present were Jim Patten, Linda Dionne, Nancy Giovanini, and Shelly Renken.

The Board approved the agenda and the minutes from the previous meeting as written with no additions or corrections.

The Board of Review met with Trae Gibbons, Pontiac Township Assessor, to review appeals filed in his jurisdiction.

#17 15-20-230-001 Timothy Haslett

The subject is a 2sty condo with 1695sf built in 1990. The current assessed value of 57,949 indicates a market value of \$173,847. The owner filed on Assessment Equity siting single-family dwellings located in Fairway View Subdivision as comparables. The Clerk noted that all of the condos were reassessed for 2020. However, after the reassessment the 4.58 township multiplier was applied, bringing the values slightly above market value. The Board of Review recommended changing the values back to the value calculated prior to the multiplier. This results in a market value of \$166,233 for the subject property.

#14 15-20-230-004 Ron Wennmaher

The subject is a 2sty condo with 1467sf built in 1990. The current assessed value of 54,658 represents a market value of \$163,395. The appellant also used comparables located in Fairway View Subdivision to argue equity. The Board review the other condos along Deerfield Rd and removed the township multiplier from the subjects assessed value. This results in a market value of \$156,792 for the subject property.

#18 15-20-230-005 Peggie Boldt Trust

The subject is another condo located in the same group as the two previous properties. The current assessed value of 60,449 indicates a market value of \$181,347. The owner listed three other condos along Deerfield Rd as comparables arguing equity as her basis for appeal. The Board of Review applied the same logic as the previous two appeals and removed the 4.58 township multiplier from the assessment. The resulting market value is \$\$173,403. The Board also noted that this particular unit has a finished basement.

As a result of the three appeals listed above, the Board applied the same logic to the remaining three units in the complex. The results are as follows:

15-20-230-002	Bldg AV 48,454	Total Market Value \$155,082
15-20-230-003	Bldg AV 50,589	Total Market Value \$161,488
15-20-230-006	Bldg AV 56,411	Total Market Value \$178,956

#15 15-20-400-016 Chief City Hospitality (First Financial Bank Tr B2243-95)
The subject is a 1.22-acre vacant parcel located on the north side of Route 116. The current assessed value of 71,419 represents a market value of \$214,257. The owner filed an appeal stating he believed the property was worth \$60,000. No evidence was submitted to substantiate that value. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#19 15-21-103-012 Brian & Kimberly Sipe
The subject is a 1.5 sty brick/frame house with 5,987sf built in 2003. The appellant lists the square footage at 4796 in one place in the appeal and 7133 in another. The correct square footage would need to be verified. The current assessed value of 250,863 represents a market value of \$752,589. The owner listed the comparable properties that have recently sold as comparables. The sale prices ranged from \$46.81 to \$130.16/sf. The subject is valued at \$105.51/sf. The township assessor noted that the owners installed an in-ground pool and a very large patio in the back of their home in 2014. The yard was fenced in and the owner would not grant access to properly measure the improvements. The pool and patio were measured using aerial photos and put on the tax rolls for the first time in 2020. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#7 15-22-277-010 Robert Zenisek
The subject is a 1.5sty frame bungalow with 1761sf built in 1918. The property recently sold on 6/26/20 for \$30,100 as a Bank REO sale. The current assessed value of 29,620 indicates a market value of \$88,860. The owner listed three sales of homes that sold between \$8.01-\$19.18/sf. The subject is currently valued at \$50.46/sf. The Board changed the grade of the subject to C-10 resulting in a market value of \$81,265.

#32 15-22-403-018 Greater Livingston County Arts Council
The subject is a 2sty brick building with 2624sf built in 1915 located downtown Pontiac. The property was purchased from the City of Pontiac in August of 2019 for \$50,000 in a private sale. The current assessed value of 58,464 indicates a market value of \$175,410. The Council is represented by Vickie Fitzgerald. The appellant believes the property is over assessed and used three recent sales as their basis. The three comparables used are all in need of updating, while the subject has recently been remodeled. The Board did note that the Assessor's records show the 2nd floor as an apartment, when in fact it is only used for studio space. The Board will make that correction. The resulting market value is \$152,500.

#24 15-22-404-004 William & Georgia Bertram
The subject is a 2sty brick building with 4,978sf built in 1900 located downtown Pontiac. The current assessed value of 54,256 represents a market value of \$162,768. The subject was purchased in 2017 for \$29,500. At the time of sale, the building was in need of many repairs. Since then the owner has invested \$74,500 in new electrical, plumbing, HVAC, flooring, drywall, etc. The main floor is now used as a Law Office. The 2nd floor is still in progress. That adjustment has already been made within the system. The Board made no further change.

#27 15-23-102-009 Jerry Clyden

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 1342sf built in 1948. The house was purchased with an adjoining lot for \$87,000 in March of 2020. The current assessed value of 21,242, plus the value of the extra lot (15-23-102-011) 1,693, total 22,935 or \$68,805 market value. The appellant also stated they have make approximately \$15,650 in improvement since the purchase. The Board made no change to the market value.

#33 15-23-311-012 Janet Goodin

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 1424sf built in 2008. The current assessed value of 38,537 represents a market value of \$115,611. The property was purchased in August of 2020 for \$72,000. At the time of the purchase, the house was in very poor condition. The owners have invested approximately \$10,000 to clean the mold, urine and feces, repair damage from leaking pipes, replace flooring and repair the furnace. The Board changed the condition to below normal and added a 25% functional obsol factor for 2020 resulting in a market value of \$84,400. The Township Assessor will review the value for 2021.

#2 15-23-329-008 Mary Lou Legner

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 960sf built in 1956. The current assessed value of 25,771 indicate a market value of \$77,321. The property was purchased in 2018 for \$80,000. The owner indicated "assessment equity" as the basis for the appeal. However, no evidence was submitted. The Board made no change to the market value.

#4 15-24-351-002 Joseph & Deloris Mattingly

The subject is a 14.80-acre timber property with a 51 x 37 shed located on it. The property is currently valued at \$41,265 or \$2,788/acre. The owner states he believes the property is worth \$29,600, but supplied no evidence. The Board made no change.

#26 15-27-278-006 Mark Weber (1st State Bank of Forrest Tr 2018-1)

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 1376sf built in 1953. The property was purchased in 2018 for \$130,000. The property is currently valued at \$121,863. The Board made no change.

#16 15-28-131-012 Charles & Barbara Fogarty

The subject is 1sty frame house with 1472sf built in 2008. The current assessed value of 55,113 indicates a market value of \$165,339. The property was purchased in 2019 for \$165,000. The owner listed three comparable properties that were built between 1990-1996. The Board reviewed several comps but made no change to the assessed value.

The Board will reconvene Tuesday, November 12, 2020 at 10:30am.

Respectfully submitted by,
Shelly Renken
Clerk of the Board of Review