

**Livingston County Board of Review
Minutes – January 8, 2020**

The Board of Review met today to review appeals that have been submitted. Present were Jim Patten, Linda Dionne, Nancy Giovanini, and Shelly Renken.

The Board approved the revised agenda. The minutes from the previous meeting as written with no additions or corrections.

The Board had one hearing on the agenda with Michael & Mary Carpenter.

#217 05-18-200-018

The subject is a 1sty brick home with 2065sf built in 1999. The current assessed value of 91,687 on the house and 1.25 acre homesite represents a market value \$275,061. The owner mentioned a property located just west of the subject that decreased in value from 2018. He also compared to 04-24-100-018 that sold 7/19 for \$286,500. This property is located on a wooded lot with three out buildings and a 3-car garage. According to the PTAX-203 recorded with the County, the property was not advertised prior to the sale. The owners are requesting the value be reduced to \$217,485. The Board changed the market value to \$247,000.

The Board also discussed the following appeals:

#87 05-10-102-005 Peter & Maureen Broeksmit

The Board had met with the Broeksmit's the previous day. The Board discussed the subject and comps used by the appellant. The subject has an improvement assessment of \$17.86/sf. The comparable properties submitted by the appellant range in value from \$15.04 to \$18.76. The Board felt the subject property fell well within the range of the comps and therefore made no change in the assessed value.

#93 14-14-400-006 Dustin & Kendra Smith

The Board had met the Mr. Smith the previous day. The Board discussed the information submitted with the appeal. The Board changed the house to a B-5 grade in Normal condition, as opposed to Above Normal, resulting in a market value of \$234,900 on the whole parcel.

The Board of Review discussed the 11 appeals filed by Vertical Bridge Towers II LLC:

| | | |
|------|---------------|---|
| #174 | 09-01-200-001 | 25% reduction was made to tower due to age and sale price |
| #175 | 07-12-300-014 | No change |
| #180 | 13-23-300-002 | No change |
| #178 | 15-28-276-012 | No change |
| #176 | 18-08-100-004 | No change |
| #173 | 25-09-400-010 | No change |
| #179 | 25-10-101-021 | No change |

#91 10-10-105-004 Aaron Vogt

The owner had been notified of a hearing date and time of December 27, 2019. However, he thought the date was January 27, 2020, and therefore, missed the scheduled hearing time. He had emailed the clerk requesting the Board take a second look at his information. According to the appeal, the owner intends to demolish the home when the mortgage holder will allow it. The house remains in disrepair on the inside according to the photos submitted. The Board applied a 50% obsolescence factor to the house for 2019 resulting in a market value of \$31,859 on the property.

#139 15-23-228-023 Steve & Wendy Garrels

The Board of Review had originally adjusted the value of this property from \$235,695 to \$227,139. The owner scheduled a hearing for 12/18/19 after receiving the Tentative Notice. During the hearing, the owner expressed concern with the lot value as it compared to his neighboring property. The Clerk reviewed the lots in the subdivision. As a result, the lot value of the subject was changed to 12,505 to give it the same av/sf price as the neighbor.

#72 15-14-358-010 Alan Schrock

The subject is an 1804sf 1sty frame home built in 1989. The current assessed value of 49,205 indicates a market value of \$147,615. An appraisal was submitted as evidence indicating a market value of \$125,000. However, the 6 comps used in the report range in adjusted prices from \$124,100 to \$154,800. The Board of Review questioned some of the adjustments made by the appraiser, as well as the use of 2016 and 2017 sales as comparables. The Board reviewed four sales that had occurred in 2019, two on Ann St and two on Franklin Way ranging in sale prices from \$79.39/sf to \$112.09/sf. The subject is currently valued at \$81.83/sf. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#61 15-14-356-020 Dale Schrock

The subject is a 1sty brick/frame home with 2608sf built in 1997. The current assessed value of 101,893 represents a market value of \$305,679. An appraisal was submitted by the appellant indicating a market value of \$240,000. The Board questioned some of the adjustments made by the appraiser, as well as the use of a 2016 and 2017 sale as comparables. The Board reviewed four 2019 sales that after adjustments to the subject indicated a value of \$317,900 to \$359,740. The Board made no change.

#53 01-01-226-009 Transco Products, Inc.

The appellant filed an appeal disputing the lot value on this property. They compared their lot assessment with three other industrial properties in Reading Township. The subject has a lot assessment of 16,373 or 2326/acre. They listed the following properties as comps:

| | |
|---------------|--------------------|
| 01-01-202-002 | 17,623 - 1595/acre |
| 01-01-105-001 | 18,248 – 1323/acre |
| 01-01-177-024 | 39,461 – 2216/acre |

The Board adjusted the subject to 1768/acre for 2019. All values need to reviewed for 2020.

#135 14-25-101-016 Scott & Jennifer Bauknecht

The owner has been emailing the Clerk with his concerns regarding the value of his lot as well as the overall assessed value. After the last change by the Board of Review, the adjusted market value of the subject is \$474,000. According to the owner, he believes his property is worth \$470,000 on the high end. He stated that anything over \$470,000 would prompt him to file with the Property Tax Appeal Board. The Board decided to stipulate to \$470,000.