

**Livingston County Board of Review
Minutes – December 11, 2019**

The Board of Review met today to start reviewing appeals that have been submitted. Present were Jim Patten, Linda Dionne, Nancy Giovanini, and Shelly Renken.

The Board approved the agenda and minutes from the previous meeting as written with no additions or corrections.

The Board of Review met with Trae Gibbons, the Pontiac Township Assessor, to review appeals filed in his jurisdiction.

#94 15-08-351-004 Joe Tissiere

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 2300sf built in 2016. Owner paid \$43,000 for the lot and garage in 2016, and then built the house. The Assessor noted that after the purchase, the owner made the garage into living area so he could reside on site while building the house. The permit price for the house was \$230,000. The owner filed an appeal on comparable sales listing three properties that sold between \$89.63-111.77. The subject is currently valued at \$116.24/sf or \$268,512. The Board noted that the owner has over \$273,000 invested in the property, not counting the improvements made to the garage. The Board made no change to the value.

#136 15-14-100-019 Robert Harty

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 1656sf built in 2006. The current assessed value of 78,124 indicates a market value of \$234,372. The owner states he believes the property is worth \$220,000. The owner filed on equity but supplied no documentation or evidence to support that value. The Board made no change.

#7 15-10-400-005 Ronald & Karen Kyrouac

The subject is a 40-acre parcel of farmland. The owner disagreed with the increase in the assessed value. Farmland assessments are determined by the Department of Revenue and applied by the Supervisor of Assessments. No change was made.

#8 15-14-303-005 Michael Henson

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 2113sf built in 2008. The current assessed value of 67,423 indicates a market value of \$202,290. The owner filed on comparable sales stating the property was worth 180,705. The comparables used by the owner ranged in price from \$76.62 to \$78.78/sf. However, they were all 18-44 years older than the subject. The Board made no change.

#61 15-14-356-020 Dale Schrock

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 2608sf built in 1997. The property also has a 648sf in-ground pool. The current assessed value of 101,893 indicates a market value of \$305,679. The owner supplied an appraisal done 11/11/19 for \$240,000. The Board questioned the comparables used by the appraiser and asked the Assessor to check his comparables and report back to the Board.

#72 15-14-358-010 Alan Schrock

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 1804sf built in 1989. The current assessed value of 49,205 indicates a market value of \$147,615. The owner supplied an appraisal done 11/11/19 for \$125,000. The Board questioned the comparables used by the appraiser and asked the Assessor to check his comparables and report back to the Board.

#14 15-21-401-014 Frank Panno

The subject is a vacant lot located on Westview Dr in Pontiac. The current assessed value of 8077 indicates a market value of \$24,231. The owner filed with the Board stating the property was over assessed when compared to the 3 other lots listed. The 3 lots listed as comparables have a preferential developer lot assessment on them and are therefore not comparable. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#214 15-22-335-017 Donald Kinsella

The subject is a 2sty brick/frame 2-unit apartment with 1105sf built in 1906. The current assessed value of 30,379 indicates a market value of \$91,137. The owner filed on comparable sales but gave no evidence or comparables. The Board noted that the house had been listed for sale but was recently removed from the market 10/6/19 when it was last priced at \$99,900 per Zillow. The Board made no change.

#137 15-22-438-003 David & Eleanor Alexander

The subject is a 2sty brick home with 2816sf built in 1890. The owner's had requested a 10-day extension in order to obtain an appraisal on the property. The appraisal was completed 11/28/19 for \$160,000. The Board changed the market value to \$160,000.

#138 15-22-480-006 Francis Fanchi

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 830sf built in 1951. The current assessed value of 31,751 indicates a market value of \$95,253. The owner believes the property is worth \$75,000. The owner filed his appeal on equity listing five properties with improvement assessments ranging from \$10.49-16.95. The subject has an improvement assessment of \$19.90. The owner also stated the attic was not finished – the area has a floor and drywall, but was never completed to be used as living area. The Board removed the finished attic and reduced the market value to \$92,500.

#96 15-23-159-015 Daniel & Barbara Fraher

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 1393sf built in 1955. The current assessed value of 25,140 indicate a market value of \$75,420. The owner filed the appeal on equity listing three properties with improvement assessments ranging from \$8.54 to \$13.21. The subject currently has an improvement assessment of \$16.32. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#62 15-23-205-018 Joseph Ronaldson

The subject is a 1sty frame ranch with 1232sf built in 1986. The current assessed value of 41,562 indicates a market value of \$124,686. The owner believes the property is worth \$102,000. The owner listed 3 comparable properties ranging in sale price from \$72-86/sf. The Board changed the grade of the house to a C reducing the market value to \$116,000.

#1 15-23-206-001 Shane Long

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 2216sf built in 1995. The owners purchased the property for \$185,000 on 11/20/17. The Board approved changing the house to a C+10 grade in Normal condition resulting in a value of \$192,600.

#16 15-23-227-002 Matthew & Amy Brummel

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 2235sf built in 1999. The current assessed value of 69,908 indicates a market value of \$209,745. The owner is requesting an adjustment to \$195,000 based on a 2015 sale. The owner also listed 3 comparable sales that sold for \$62.05-94.01/sf. The subject is currently valued at \$93.85/sf. The Board made no change.

#73 15-23-227-003 Jacob & Rebecca Campbell

The subject is a 1½-sty frame house with 1982sf built in 1995. The current assessed value of 68,397 indicates a market value of \$205,191. The owners purchased the property in 2014 for \$185,000. The owner listed comparable sales ranging from \$70.58-122.95. The subject is currently valued at \$103.52/sf. The Board made no change.

#139 15-23-228-023 Steven Garrels

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 2350sf built in 2002. The current assessed value of 78,565 indicates a market value of \$235,695. The owner filed on equity listing 6 comparables with improvement assessments ranging from \$21.71-31.49. The subject currently has an improvement assessment of \$27.72. The Board agreed to change the grade to C+5 resulting in a market value of \$227,135 or \$26.50/sf.

#63 15-23-278-001 Calvin Brainard

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 1804sf built in 2005. The current assessed value of 72,293 indicates a market value of \$216,879. The property was purchased in 2014 for \$210,000. The owner believes the property is worth \$203,640 based several comparables listed ranging in value from \$26.45-41.40/sf. The subject is currently valued at \$40.07/sf. The Board made no change.

#140 15-23-277-004 Tod Garrels

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 1782sf built in 2005. The assessed value of 68,086 indicates a market value of \$204,258. The owner filed the appeal on equity listing 3 properties with improvement assessments of \$24.16-26.55. The subject has an improvement assessment of \$32.62. The Board approved changing the house to a C+5 resulting in a value of \$196,600.

#64 15-23-278-005 Mark Steidinger

The subject is a 1sty frame home with 1850sf built in 2005. The assessed value of 85562 indicates a market value of \$256,686. The owner believes the property is worth \$205,650. The owner listed 3 comparable sales ranging from \$87.13-108.53/sf. The owner is currently valued at \$138.76/sf but is newer than two of the comps and has an in-ground pool. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#9 15-23-307-008 Patrick Kelleher

The subject is a duplex located on Washington St in Pontiac. The owner recently purchased the property on 10/29/19 for \$65,000. The Board changed the market value to \$65,000.

#51 15-23-309-009 Jordan Triplett

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 1237sf built in 1916. The property was recently purchased on 11/14/19 for \$32,500 from the Bank of Pontiac. The owner also submitted an appraisal done 11/4/19 for \$34,000. The Board changed the value to \$34,000.

#2 15-24-302-012 Mark & Kelli Trainor

The subject is a 2sty frame house with 2152sf built in 1974. The current assessed value of 52,503 indicates a market value of \$158,503. The owner believes the property is worth \$150,000. The Board made no change.

#10 15-24-326-015 Allen Morrison

The subject is a 1sty frame house with 2117sf built in 1979. The current assessed value of 57,408 indicates a market value of \$172,224. The owner believes the property is worth \$140,000 based on 3 sales the owner listed ranging in price from \$71-78/sf. The subject is currently valued at \$81/sf. The Board made no change.

#52 15-24-452-018 Andrew & Karen Jordan

The subject is a split-level frame house with 1496sf built in 2000. The assessed value of 70,573 indicates a market value of \$211,719. The owner submitted an appraisal dated 10/3/19 for \$185,000. The Board changed the house to Normal condition resulting in a value of \$187,800.

#97 15-25-200-007 Thomas Roe

The subject is a 1sty brick home with 2648sf built in 1963 located on 6.84 acres with a horse barn. The current assessed value of 80,339 indicates a market value of \$214,017. The owner believes the property is worth \$213,000. He provided 3 comparable properties that sold for \$75-44-121.44/sf. The subject is valued at \$91.02/sf. The Board made no change.

#95 15-25-200-009 Thomas Roe

The subject is a 29.93-acre timber tract of land. The current assessed value of 18,236 indicates a market value of \$54,708 or \$1828/acre. The owner believes the property is worth \$32,000. The Board made no change to the assessed value.

#37 15-27-230-014 Andrew & Stacy Zehr

The subject is a 2sty brick home with 5770sf built in 1974. The current assessed value of 112,333 indicates a market value of \$336,999. The owners recently purchased the property for \$275,000 on 6/19. The owner supplied a copy of the appraisal done 10/21/18 indicating a value of \$285,000. The Board changed the value to \$290,000.

#19 15-27-233-008 James Dunning

The subject is a 1sty brick home with 1915sf built in 1965 located on the south side of Pontiac. The current assessed value of 47,124 indicates a market value of \$141,386. The owner submitted an appraisal that was done in 2016 indicating a market value of \$135,000. The Board made no change.

#76 15-27-259-010 Sally Kneip

The subject is a ½ duplex located on Garden Ave in Pontiac. The current assessed value of 29,730 indicates a market value of \$89,190. The owner believes the property is worth \$84,500 based on the 2017 purchase price. The Board noted a 2018 sale of a comparable unit that sold for \$92,000. The Board made no change.

#213 15-27-276-012 Mark & Karla Connelly

The subject is a 1sty frame home with 1946sf built in 1966. The property is currently assessed for 39,238 or \$117,714 market value. The owner believes the property is worth \$80-90,000. The owner filed on equity listing comps ranging from \$15.51-18.07. The subject has an improvement assessment of \$17.72. The Board change the house to a C+10 in Normal condition resulting in a value of \$95,800.

#98 15-27-427-008 Nicole Hall

The subject is a 1sty brick home with 1668sf built in 1961. The owner recently purchased the property 1/16/18 for \$122,500. However, she believes she over paid and the actual value should be \$105,000 based on comparable sales. The Board made no change.

#186 15-28-226-006 MBR Pontiac/Streator LLC

The subject is a fast-food restaurant that recently changed hands. The property is currently assessed at 147,313, indicating a market value of \$441,939. The owner supplied a signed letter of intent to purchase dated 12/3/18 stating the purchase price will be \$400,000. They also supplied an "unsigned" purchase agreement stating the purchase price will be \$350,000 for the property, equipment and other agreements. In the appeal, the appellant states the property was purchased for \$400,000 minus \$100,000 for personal property, or a net consideration of \$300,000. However, there is conflicting documentation supplied and nothing has been recorded with the county to date. The Board made no change.

#17 15-28-251-001 Christopher Miller

The subject is a 1sty brick home with 1948sf built in 1974. The owner purchased the property 11/18/16 for \$148,000. The current assessed value indicates a market value of \$192,500. The owner submitted an appraisal completed 9/3/19 for \$155,000. The Board noted the house across the road (15-28-100-008) recently sold for \$200,000. The Board made no change.

#4 15-29-200-008 Kaival Hospitality Inc

The subject property is the Super 8 Hotel located on the West side of Pontiac along I-55. The current assessed value of 287,913 indicates a market value of \$863,826. The owner submitted an appraisal dated 6/24/19 indicating a value based on sales at \$846,000 and based on income at \$791,000. The Board changed the market value to \$812,000.